

# REAL ANALYSIS

## TOPIC 34 - ALGEBRAS OF SETS

PAUL L. BAILEY

### 1. SEQUENCES OF SETS

**1.1. Collections and Families.** A *collection* of sets is a set whose members are sets. Let  $\mathcal{C}$  be a collection of sets. Define the *union* and *intersection* of the sets in the collection by

- *Union:*  $\cup \mathcal{C} = \{x \mid x \in C \text{ for some } C \in \mathcal{C}\};$
- *Intersection:*  $\cap \mathcal{C} = \{x \mid x \in C \text{ for all } C \in \mathcal{C}\};$

An alternative notion for this is

- $\cup_{C \in \mathcal{C}} C = \cup \mathcal{C};$
- $\cap_{C \in \mathcal{C}} C = \cap \mathcal{C}.$

We wish to view the sets in the collection as being subsets of some bigger set. If this bigger set is not in evidence, we can always let  $X = \cup \mathcal{C}$ , in which case,  $\mathcal{C}$  is a collection of subsets of  $X$ .

It is often convenient to label each set with an index from another set, a so-called *indexing set*. This allows us to repeat and occurrence of a set, and if the indexing set is ordered, to put an order on the sets.

A *family* of subsets of a set  $X$  indexed by a set  $J$  is a function

$$f : J \rightarrow \mathcal{P}(X).$$

If  $j \in J$ , we write  $A_j$  to mean  $f(j)$ . It is common to suppress the  $f$  in the notation, as follows.

Let  $\{A_j \mid j \in J\}$  be a family of subsets of  $X$  indexed by  $J$ . We note that  $J$  may be finite, countably infinite, or even uncountable. It is common that  $J = \mathbb{N}$ , in which case the family is countable and ordered.

Define the *union* and *intersection* of the sets in the family by

- *Union:*  $\cup_{j \in J} A_j = \{x \in X \mid x \in A_j \text{ for some } j \in J\};$
- *Intersection:*  $\cap_{j \in J} A_j = \{x \in X \mid x \in A_j \text{ for all } j \in J\}.$

If  $J = \{1, \dots, n\}$ , this is commonly written

- $\cup_{j=1}^n A_j = \cup_{j \in J} A_j;$
- $\cap_{j=1}^n A_j = \cap_{j \in J} A_j.$

If  $J = \mathbb{N}$ , this is commonly written

- $\cup_{j=1}^{\infty} A_j = \cup_{j \in J} A_j;$
- $\cap_{j=1}^{\infty} A_j = \cap_{j \in J} A_j.$

**1.2. Sequences of Sets.** A sequence of sets is a family of sets indexed by  $\mathbb{N}$ .

**Definition 1.** Let  $X$  be a set. A *sequence of subsets of  $X$*  is a function  $A : \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathcal{P}(X)$ . We write  $A_n$  to mean  $A(n)$ , and we write  $(A_n)$  to indicate the entire sequence.

If  $\mathcal{A} \subset \mathcal{P}(X)$ , a *sequence in  $\mathcal{A}$*  is a sequence of subsets of  $X$  such that  $A_n \in \mathcal{A}$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ .

Let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence of subsets of  $X$ . There is a corresponding collection of subsets of  $X$ , say  $\mathcal{A} = \{A_n \mid n \in \mathbb{N}\}$ . The reader should note a couple of distinctions between these objects: the sets in  $(A_n)$  come in a specific order, whereas the sets in  $\mathcal{A}$  have no order. Also, the same set may appear multiple time in the sequence  $(A_n)$ , whereas there is no notion of the multiplicity of a member of  $\mathcal{A}$ . However, we should note that unions and intersections may be written in two ways:

$$\cup \mathcal{A} = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n \quad \text{and} \quad \cap \mathcal{A} = \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n.$$

If  $A \subset X$ , we let  $A^c = X \setminus A$ . That is, the ambient set  $X$  is assumed to be understood in our notation.

**Definition 2.** Let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence of subsets of a set  $X$ . We say that  $(A_n)$  is *disjoint* if  $A_i \cap A_j = \emptyset$ , for all  $i, j \in \mathbb{N}$  with  $i \neq j$ .

**Proposition 1.** Let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence of subsets of a set  $X$ . Then there exists a disjoint sequence  $(B_n)$  such that  $B_n \subset A_n$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , and

$$\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} B_n = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n.$$

*Proof.* Set  $B_n = A_n \setminus (\bigcup_{i=1}^{n-1} A_i)$ . Then  $B_n \subset A_n$ , so it is clear that  $\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} B_n \subset \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n$ . Let  $A = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n$ , and let  $x \in A$ . Then  $x \in A_n$  for some  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ; let  $k = \min\{n \in \mathbb{N} \mid x \in A_n\}$ . Then  $x \notin A_n$  for  $n < k$ , so  $x \notin \bigcup_{i=1}^{k-1} A_i$ , so  $x \in B_k = A_k \setminus \bigcup_{i=1}^{k-1} A_i$ . Thus  $\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} B_n = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n$ .

If  $n < k$ , then  $x \notin A_n$ , so  $x \notin B_n$ . If  $n > k$ ,  $A_k$  is removed from  $B_n$ , so  $x \notin B_n$ . This is why the sequence  $(B_n)$  is disjoint.  $\square$

The following properties are relatively easy to see.

**Proposition 2** (Distributive Laws). Let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence of subsets of a set  $X$ . Let  $B \subset X$ . Then

- (a)  $\left( \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n \right) \cap B = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} (A_n \cap B);$
- (b)  $\left( \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n \right) \cup B = \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} (A_n \cup B).$

*Proof.* Exercise.  $\square$

**Proposition 3** (DeMorgan's Laws). Let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence of subsets of a set  $X$ . Then

- (a)  $\left( \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n \right)^c = \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n^c;$
- (b)  $\left( \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n \right)^c = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n^c.$

*Proof.* Exercise.  $\square$

**Proposition 4.** Let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence of functions from a set  $X$ . Let  $f : X \rightarrow Y$ . Then

- (a)  $f\left(\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n\right) = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} f(A_n)$ ;
- (b)  $f\left(\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n\right) \subset \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} f(A_n)$ .

*Proof.*

(a) (⊂) Let  $y \in f(\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n)$ . Then  $y = f(x)$  for some  $x \in \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n$ . There exists  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $x \in A_n$ , so  $y \in f(A_n)$ . Thus  $y \in \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} f(A_n)$ .

(a) (⊃) Let  $y \in \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} f(A_n)$ . Then  $y \in f(A_n)$  for some  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , so  $y = f(x)$  for some  $x \in A_n$ . Now  $x \in \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n$ , so  $f(x) \in f(\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n)$ .

(b) (⊂) Let  $y \in f(\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n)$ . Then  $y = f(x)$  for some  $x \in \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n$ . Then  $x \in A_n$  for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , so  $y = f(x) \in f(A_n)$  for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . Thus  $y \in \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} f(A_n)$ . □

Can you find an example where the inverse inclusion of (b) above does not hold?

**Proposition 5.** Let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence of functions from a set  $X$ . Let  $g : Y \rightarrow X$ . Then

- (a)  $g^{-1}\left(\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n\right) = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} g^{-1}(A_n)$ ;
- (b)  $g^{-1}\left(\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n\right) = \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} g^{-1}(A_n)$ .

*Proof.*

(a) (⊂) Let  $x \in g^{-1}(\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n)$ , and let  $y = g(x)$ . Then  $y \in \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n$ , so  $y \in A_n$  for some  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . Thus  $x \in g^{-1}(A_n)$ , so  $x \in \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} g^{-1}(A_n)$ .

(a) (⊃) Let  $x \in \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} g^{-1}(A_n)$ , and let  $y = g(x)$ . Then  $x \in g^{-1}(A_n)$  for some  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , so  $y \in A_n$ . Then  $y \in \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n$ , so  $x \in g^{-1}(\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n)$ .

(b) (⊂) Let  $x \in g^{-1}(\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n)$ , and let  $y = g(x)$ . Then  $y \in \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n$ , so  $y \in A_n$  for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . Thus  $x \in g^{-1}(A_n)$  for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , so  $x \in \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} g^{-1}(A_n)$ .

(b) (⊃) Let  $x \in \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} g^{-1}(A_n)$ , and let  $y = g(x)$ . Then  $x \in g^{-1}(A_n)$  for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , so  $y \in A_n$  for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . Then  $y \in \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n$ , so  $x \in g^{-1}(\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n)$ . □

**1.3. Monotone Sequences.** The power set of  $X$ ,  $\mathcal{P}(X)$ , is partially ordered by inclusion. That is, if  $A \subset B$ , we may think of  $A$  as “less than”  $B$  in this partial order. If  $A$  is not contained in  $B$ , and  $B$  is not contained in  $A$ , they are not related by this partial order. We may use this partial order to define monotone sequences of sets.

**Definition 3.** Let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence of subsets of a set  $X$ .

We say that  $(A_n)$  is *increasing* (or *nondecreasing*, or *expanding*) if  $A_k \subset A_{k+1}$ , for all  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ .

We say that  $(A_n)$  is *decreasing* (or *nonincreasing*, or *contracting*) if  $A_k \supset A_{k+1}$ , for all  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ .

We say that  $(A_n)$  is *monotone* if it is either increasing or decreasing.

**Problem 1.** Let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence of subsets of a set  $X$ .

- (a) Show that if  $(A_n)$  is increasing, then  $\bigcap_{n=k}^{\infty} A_n = A_k$ .
- (b) Show that if  $(A_n)$  is decreasing, then  $\bigcup_{n=k}^{\infty} A_n = A_k$ .
- (c) Show that if  $(A_n)$  is decreasing if and only if  $(A_n^c)$  is increasing sequence.

**Problem 2.** Let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence of subsets of a set  $X$ . Define two new sequences of sets,

- $\underline{A}_n = \bigcap_{j=n}^{\infty} A_j$ .
- $\overline{A}_n = \bigcup_{j=n}^{\infty} A_j$ .

- (a) Show that  $(\underline{A}_n)$  is an increasing sequence of sets.
- (b) Show that  $(\overline{A}_n)$  is a decreasing sequence of sets.

**Problem 3.** Let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence of subsets of a set  $X$ .

- (a) Show that, for all  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , we have

$$\underline{A}_n \subset A_n \subset \overline{A}_n.$$

- (b) Find a sequence of sets  $(A_n)$  such that
  - $A_i \neq A_j$  for  $i \neq j$ , and
  - $\underline{A}_i \not\subset A_i \not\subset \overline{A}_i$ .

**1.4. Limits of Sequences of Sets.** We define limits of sequences of sets. Although the definition uses the order of the sets imposed by the fact it is indexed by  $\mathbb{N}$ , it turns out that any rearrangement of the sets will produce the same limits, as we now define them.

**Definition 4.** Let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence of subsets of a set  $X$ .

The *limit inferior* of  $(A_n)$  is

$$\liminf A_n = \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} \bigcap_{j=i}^{\infty} A_j.$$

The *limit superior* of  $(A_n)$  is

$$\limsup A_n = \bigcap_{i=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{j=i}^{\infty} A_j.$$

An alternative notation is used by some books: let  $\underline{\lim} A_n = \liminf A_n$  and  $\overline{\lim} A_n = \limsup A_n$ . We may call  $\underline{\lim} A_n$  the *lower limit* and  $\overline{\lim} A_n$  the *upper limit*.

**Problem 4.** Let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence of subsets of a set  $X$ .

- (a) Show that  $\underline{\lim} A_n = \lim \underline{A}_n$ .
- (b) Show that  $\overline{\lim} A_n = \lim \overline{A}_n$ .

**Proposition 6.** Let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence of subsets of a set  $X$ . Show that

- (a)  $\liminf A_n = \{x \in X \mid x \in A_n \text{ for all but finitely many } n \in \mathbb{N}\};$
- (b)  $\limsup A_n = \{x \in X \mid x \in A_n \text{ for infinitely many } n \in \mathbb{N}\};$
- (c)  $\liminf A_n \subset \limsup A_n.$

*Proof.*

(a) ( $\subset$ ) Suppose that  $x \in A_n$  for all but finitely many  $n$ . Then, let  $N \in \mathbb{N}$  be so large that  $x \in A_n$  for  $n \geq N$ . Then  $x \in \cap_{j=N}^{\infty} A_j = \underline{A}_N$ , so  $x \in \cup_{i=1}^{\infty} \underline{A}_i = \liminf A_n$ .

(a) ( $\supset$ ) Suppose that  $x \in \liminf A_n$ . Then  $x \in \cup_{i=1}^{\infty} \underline{A}_i$ , so  $x \in \underline{A}_i$  for some  $i \in \mathbb{N}$ . But  $\underline{A}_i = \cap_{j=i}^{\infty} A_j$ , so  $x \in A_j$  for all  $j \geq i$ . Thus  $x \in A_n$  for all but finitely many  $n$ .

(b) ( $\subset$ ) Suppose that  $x \in A_n$  for infinitely many  $n$ . Then for every  $i \in \mathbb{N}$ , there exists  $n \geq i$  such that  $x \in A_n$ . Thus for every  $i \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $x \in \cup_{j=i}^{\infty} A_j = \overline{A}_i$ . Thus  $x \in \cap_{i=1}^{\infty} \overline{A}_i = \limsup A_n$ .

(b) ( $\supset$ ) Suppose that  $x \in \limsup A_n$ . Then  $x \in \cap_{i=1}^{\infty} \overline{A}_i$ , so  $x \in \overline{A}_i = \cup_{j=i}^{\infty} A_j$  for all  $i$ . Thus, for every  $i \in \mathbb{N}$ , there exists  $n \geq i$  such that  $x \in A_n$ , which implies that  $x \in A_n$  for infinitely many  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ .

(c) Let  $x \in \liminf A_n$ . Then  $x \in A_n$  for all but finitely many  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ; since  $\mathbb{N}$  is infinitely, this implies that  $x \in A_n$  for infinitely many  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , so  $x \in \limsup A_n$ .  $\square$

**Definition 5.** Let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence of subsets of a set  $X$ .

We say that  $(A_n)$  *converges* if  $\liminf A_n = \limsup A_n$ . In this case, the *limit* of  $(A_n)$  is

$$\lim A_n = \liminf A_n = \limsup A_n.$$

If we claim that  $\lim A_n = L$ , we mean that  $(A_n)$  converges, and that the limit of  $(A_n)$  is  $L$ .

**Problem 5.** Let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence of subsets of a set  $X$ .

- (a) Show that if  $(A_n)$  is decreasing, then  $\lim A_n = \cap_{i=1}^{\infty} A_i$ .
- (b) Show that if  $(A_n)$  is increasing, then  $\lim A_n = \cup_{i=1}^{\infty} A_i$ .

**Problem 6.** Let  $(A_n)$  and  $(B_n)$  be sequences of subsets of a set  $X$ . Show that

$$(\underline{\lim} A_n \cup \underline{\lim} B_n) \subset \underline{\lim}(A_n \cup B_n) \subset (\underline{\lim} A_n \cup \underline{\lim} B_n) \subset \overline{\lim}(A_n \cup B_n) \subset (\overline{\lim} A_n \cup \overline{\lim} B_n).$$

## 2. ALGEBRAS OF SETS

## 2.1. Algebras of Sets.

**Definition 6.** Let  $X$  be a set and let  $\mathcal{A} \subset \mathcal{P}(X)$ . We say that  $\mathcal{A}$  is an *algebra* of subsets of  $X$  if

- (A0)  $X \in \mathcal{A}$ ;
- (A1)  $A, B \in \mathcal{A}$  implies  $A \cup B \in \mathcal{A}$ ;
- (A2)  $A \in \mathcal{A}$  implies  $A^c \in \mathcal{A}$ , where  $A^c = X \setminus A$ .

**Proposition 7.** Let  $\mathcal{A}$  be an algebra of subsets of  $X$ . Then

- (A3)  $A, B \in \mathcal{A}$  implies  $A \cap B \in \mathcal{A}$ , and
- (A4)  $A, B \in \mathcal{A}$  implies  $A \setminus B \in \mathcal{A}$ .

*Proof.* Let  $A, B \in \mathcal{A}$ . Then  $A^c, B^c \in \mathcal{A}$  by (A2), and  $A^c \cup B^c \in \mathcal{A}$  by (A1). The by DeMorgan's Law and (A2) again,

$$A \cap B = (A^c \cup B^c)^c \in \mathcal{A}.$$

Now note that  $A \setminus B = A \cap B^c \in \mathcal{A}$ , by (A2) and (A3). □

**Proposition 8.** Let  $\mathcal{C}$  be a collection of subsets of a set  $X$  satisfying

- (C0)  $X \in \mathcal{C}$ ;
- (C1)  $A, B \in \mathcal{C}$  implies  $A \setminus B \in \mathcal{C}$ .

Then  $\mathcal{C}$  is an algebra of subsets of  $X$ .

*Proof.* Exercise. □

**Proposition 9.** Let  $\mathfrak{A}$  be a collection of algebras of subsets of a set  $X$ . Then  $\cap \mathfrak{A}$  is an algebra of subsets of  $X$ .

*Proof.* Let  $A, B \in \cap \mathfrak{A}$ . Then  $A, B \in \mathcal{A}$  for every  $\mathcal{A} \in \mathfrak{A}$ . Since each  $\mathcal{A}$  in  $\mathfrak{A}$  is an algebra,  $A \cup B$  and  $A^c$  are in  $\mathcal{A}$ , for every  $\mathcal{A}$  in  $\mathfrak{A}$ . So,  $A \cup B$  and  $A^c$  are in  $\cap \mathfrak{A}$ . □

**Definition 7.** Let  $X$  be a set and let  $\mathcal{C} \subset \mathcal{P}(X)$ . The *algebra generated by  $\mathcal{C}$*  is

$$\langle \mathcal{C} \rangle = \cap \{ \mathcal{A} \subset \mathcal{P}(X) \mid \mathcal{A} \text{ is an algebra which contains } \mathcal{C} \}.$$

One sees that the algebra generated by  $\mathcal{C}$  is the smallest algebra which contains all the sets in  $\mathcal{C}$ .

**Proposition 10.** *Let  $\mathcal{A}$  be an algebra of subsets of  $X$ , and let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence of sets in  $\mathcal{A}$ . Then there exists a sequence  $(B_n)$  of sets in  $\mathcal{A}$  such that  $B_j \cap B_k = \emptyset$  if  $j \neq k$ , and*

$$\bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} B_i = \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} A_i.$$

*Proof.* Define

$$B_n = A_n \setminus \left( \bigcup_{i=1}^{n-1} A_i \right).$$

Since  $B_n \subset A_n$ , it is clear that

$$\bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} B_i \subset \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} A_i.$$

Let  $x \in \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} A_i$ . Then  $x \in A_i$  for some  $i$ ; let  $n$  denote the smallest positive integer such that  $x \in A_n$ . Then  $x \in A_n \setminus (\bigcup_{i=1}^{n-1} A_i)$ , so  $x \in B_n$ . Thus  $x \in \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} B_i$ , so

$$\bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} A_i \subset \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} B_i,$$

which implies that

$$\bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} B_i = \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} A_i.$$

Suppose that  $x \in B_j \cap B_k$  for some  $j < k$ ; then  $x \in B_j$ , so  $x \in A_j$ . But then  $x \in \bigcup_{i=1}^{k-1} A_i$ , so  $x \notin A_k \setminus (\bigcup_{i=1}^{k-1} A_i) = B_k$ , a contradiction. Thus  $B_j \cap B_k = \emptyset$ .  $\square$

## 2.2. Sigma Algebras.

**Definition 8.** Let  $X$  be a set and let  $\mathcal{A} \subset \mathcal{P}(X)$ . We say that  $\mathcal{A}$  is a  $\sigma$ -algebra of subsets of  $X$  if

- (S0)  $X \in \mathcal{A}$ ;
- (S1) if  $\mathcal{C} \subset \mathcal{A}$  is countable, then  $\bigcup \mathcal{C} \in \mathcal{A}$ ;
- (S2) if  $A \in \mathcal{A}$ , then  $A^c \in \mathcal{A}$ .

That is, a  $\sigma$ -algebra is an algebra which is not only closed under finite unions, but is also closed under countable unions.

**Proposition 11.** *Let  $\mathcal{A}$  be an  $\sigma$ -algebra of subsets of  $X$ . Then*

- (S3) *if  $\mathcal{C} \subset \mathcal{A}$  is countable, then  $\bigcap \mathcal{C} \in \mathcal{A}$ .*

*Proof.* DeMorgan's Law also applies to infinite collections; let  $\mathcal{C} \subset \mathcal{A}$  be countable. Then

$$\bigcap \mathcal{C} = \bigcap_{A \in \mathcal{C}} A = \left( \bigcup_{A \in \mathcal{C}} A^c \right)^c.$$

Now if  $A \in \mathcal{C}$ , then  $A \in \mathcal{A}$ , so  $A^c \in \mathcal{A}$ . Thus  $\bigcup_{A \in \mathcal{C}} A^c$  is a countable union of sets in  $\mathcal{A}$ , and so is in  $\mathcal{A}$ . Thus its complement  $\bigcap \mathcal{C}$  is in  $\mathcal{A}$ .  $\square$

**Proposition 12.** *Let  $\mathfrak{A}$  be a collection of  $\sigma$ -algebras of subsets of a set  $X$ . Then  $\bigcap \mathfrak{A}$  is an  $\sigma$ -algebra of subsets of  $X$ .*

*Proof.* Exercise.  $\square$

**Definition 9.** Let  $X$  be a set and let  $\mathcal{C} \subset \mathcal{P}(X)$ . The  $\sigma$ -algebra generated by  $\mathcal{C}$ , denoted  $\langle \mathcal{C} \rangle$ , is the intersection of all  $\sigma$ -algebras which contain  $\mathcal{C}$ .

We see that  $\langle \mathcal{C} \rangle$  is necessarily a  $\sigma$ -algebra, and is the smallest  $\sigma$ -algebra which contains all of the sets in the collection  $\mathcal{C}$ .

**Proposition 13.** Let  $\mathcal{A}$  be a  $\sigma$ -algebra of subsets of a set  $X$ . Let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence in  $\mathcal{A}$ . Then

- (a)  $\underline{A}_n, \overline{A}_n \in \mathcal{A}$ ;
- (b)  $\liminf A_n, \limsup A_n \in \mathcal{A}$ .

*Proof.* Since  $\underline{A}_n = \cup_{i=n}^{\infty} A_i$  is a union of countable collection from  $\mathcal{A}$ , we know that  $\underline{A}_n \in \mathcal{A}$ . Also,  $\overline{A}_n = \cap_{i=n}^{\infty} \overline{A_i}$  is the union of a countable collection, so  $\overline{A}_n \in \mathcal{A}$ .

Now  $\liminf A_n = \cup_{i=1}^{\infty} \underline{A}_i$ , so  $\liminf A_n$  is a countable union of sets in  $\mathcal{A}$ , so  $\liminf A_n \in \mathcal{A}$ . Similarly,  $\limsup A_n = \cap_{i=1}^{\infty} \overline{A}_i$ , so  $\limsup A_n$  is a countable intersection of sets in  $\mathcal{A}$ , and so is in  $\mathcal{A}$ .  $\square$

### 3. EXERCISES

**Problem 7.** Let  $(A_n)$  be a sequence of subsets of a set  $X$ . Show that

$$\liminf A_n = (\limsup A_n^c)^c.$$

**Problem 8.** Let  $X = \mathbb{R}$ . Define a sequence  $(A_n)$  of subsets  $X$  by

$$A_n = \begin{cases} \left[0, \frac{1}{n}\right] & \text{if } n \text{ is odd;} \\ [0, n] & \text{if } n \text{ is even.} \end{cases}$$

Find  $\liminf A_n$  and  $\limsup A_n$ .

**Problem 9.** Let  $X = [0, 1] \subset \mathbb{R}$ . Define a sequence  $(A_n)$  of subsets  $X$  by

$$A_n = \left\{ \frac{m}{n} \mid m \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } 0 \leq m \leq n \right\}.$$

Find  $\liminf A_n$  and  $\limsup A_n$ .

**Problem 10.** Let  $X = \mathbb{R}$ . Define a sequence  $(A_n)$  of subsets  $X$  by

$$a_n = 4 \sin^2 \frac{2\pi n}{3} \text{ and } A_n = [a_n - 1, a_n + 1].$$

Find  $\liminf A_n$  and  $\limsup A_n$ .